# REAL ESTATE APPELLATE TRIBUNAL, PUNJAB SCO No. 95-98, Bank Square, P.F.C Building, Sector-17-B, Chandigarh

Subject: -

### **APPEAL NO. 74 OF 2022**

Bharat Bhushan, S/o Sh. Harish Kumar, R/o House No 63, 22 Acre Area, Barnala (Punjab).

...Appellant

### Versus

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

### APPEAL NO. 75 OF 2022

Santosh Rani, W/o Sh. Bharat Bhushan, R/o House No 63, 22 Acre Area, Barnala (Punjab).

...Appellant

#### Versus

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

### APPEAL NO. 76 OF 2022

Hari Chand S/o Sh. Panna Lal, R/o House No. 290, Astha Enclave, Barnala (Punjab).

...Appellant

Versus

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

### APPEAL NO. 77 OF 2022

Vinod Kumar S/o Sh. Charanjeet Lal, R/o House No. BX1119, ST No. 3, KC Road, Barnala (Punjab).

...Appellant

### Versus

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

### APPEAL NO. 78 OF 2022

Ashok Kumar S/o Sh. Randhir Singh, R/o Flat No. 91, Pocket 2, Sector 19, Green View Apartment, Dwarka, South West District, New Delhi-110075

...Appellant

#### Versus

Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.

- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

### APPEAL NO. 79 OF 2022

Achal Kumar, S/o Sh. Prakash Chand, R/o SCO 10 C, Old Tehsil Complex, Barnala, Punjab.

...Appellant

### Versus

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

Memo No. R.E.A.T./2022/390

To,

REAL ESTATE REGULATORY AUTHORITY, PUNJAB 1<sup>ST</sup> FLOOR, BLOCK B, PLOT NO.3, MADHYA MARG, SECTOR-18, CHANDIGARH-160018.

Whereas appeals titled and numbered as above were filed before the Real Estate Appellate Tribunal, Punjab. As required by Section 44 (4) of the Real Estate (Regulation and Development) Act, 2016, a certified copy of the order passed in aforesaid appeals is being forwarded to you and the same may be uploaded on website.

Given under my hand and the seal of the Hon'ple Tribunal this  $04^{\mathrm{th}}$ 

day of August, 2022.

REGISTRAR

REAL ESTATE APPELLATE TRIBUNAL, PUNJAB

MEMO OF PARTIS
Appeal No. 74 of 2022

### Between

Bharat Bhushan, S/o Sh. Harish Kumar, R/o House No. 63, 22 Acre Area, Barnala Punjab

... Appellant

### And

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority Punjab, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Block B,
   Plot No. 3, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh-160008
   through its Assistant Manager
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector 62,
   Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode- 147002

...Respondents

CHANDIGARH (ASHOK GUPTA & EKLAVYA GUPTA)
DATED: 04.05.2022 ADVOCATES

P/410/1979 & P/1513/2009 COUNSELS FOR THE APPELLANT Mobile No. 94170-06601 Email ID eklavya3@gmail.com



## IN THE REAL ESTATE APPELLATE TRIBUNAL PUNJAB AT CHANDIGARH

MENO OF PARTIES

Appeal No. 75 of 2022

### Between:

Santosh Rani, W/o Sh. Bharat Bhushan, R/o House No. 63, 22 Acre Area, Barnala Punjab

... Appellant

### Versus

- 1. Real Estate Regulatory Authority Punjab, 1st Floor, Block B, Plot No. 3, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh-160008 through its Assistant Manager
- 2. Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector 62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode- 147002

... Respondents

DATED:04.05.2022

CHANDIGARH (ASHOK GUPTA & EKLAVYA GUPTA) ADVOCATES

P/410/1979 & P/1513/2009 COUNSELS FOR THE APPELLANT Mobile No. 94170-06601 Email ID eklavya3@gmail.com

# IN THE REAL ESTATE APPELLATE TRIBUNAL PUNJAB AT CHANDIGARH

Appeal No. <u>76</u> of 2022

MEOM OF PARTI

Between

Hari Chand S/o Sh. Panna Lal, R/o House No. 290, Aastha Enclave, Barnala Punjab ....Appellant

### And

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority Punjab, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Block B,
   Plot No. 3, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh-160008
   through its Assistant Manager
- 2.Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector 62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode- 147002

... Respondents

CHANDIGARH

DATED:04.05.2022

(ASHOK GUPTA & EKLAVYA GUPTA)

ADVOCATES
P/410/1979 & P/1513/2009
COUNSELS FOR THE APPELLANT
Mobile No. 94170-06601
Email ID eklavya3@gmail.com

AT CHANDIGARH ARTIES

MEMO OF PARTIES

Appeal No. 77 of 2022

### Between

Vinod Kumar S/o Sh. Charanjeet Lal, R/o House No. BX1119, ST No. 3, KC Road, Barnala Punjab

...Appellant

### And

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority Punjab, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Block B,
   Plot No. 3, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh-160008
   through its Assistant Manager
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector 62,
   Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode- 147002

... Respondents

CHANDIGARH DATED:04.05.2022 (ASHOK GUPTA & EKLAVYA GUPTA ADVOCATES P/410/1979 & P/1513/2009 COUNSELS FOR THE APPELLANT Mobile No. 94170-06601 Email ID eklavya3@gmail.com



AT CHANDIGARH

MEMO OF PARTIES

Appeal No. 72 of 2022

### Between

Ashok Kumar S/o Sh. Randhir Singh, R/o Flat No. 91, Pocket 2, Sector 19, Green View Apartments, Dwarka, South West District, New Delhi-110075

.. Appellant

### And

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority Punjab, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Block B,
   Plot No. 3, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh-160008
   through its Assistant Manager
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector 62,
   Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode- 147002

...Respondents

CHANDIGARH DATED:04.05.2022 (ASHOK GUPTA & EKLAVYA GUPTA)
ADVOCATES

P/410/1979 & P/1513/2009 COUNSELS FOR THE APPELLANT Mobile No. 94170-06601 Email ID eklavya3@gmail.com

AT CHANDIGARH TIES.

Appeal No. 79 of 2022

### Between

Achal Kumar, s/o Sh. Prakash Chand, R/o SCO 10 C, Old Tehsil Complex, Barnala, Punjab

... Appellant

And

- 1. Real Estate Regulatory Authority Punjab, 1st Floor, Block B, Plot No. 3, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh-160008 through its Assistant Manager
- 2. Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector 62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode- 147002

Respondents

CHANDIGARH DATED:04.05.2022 ADVOCATES

P/410/1979 & P/1513/2009 COUNSELS FOR THE APPELLANT Mobile No. 94170-06601

Email ID eklavya3@gmail.com



# BEFORE THE REAL ESTATE APPELLATE TRIBUNAL, PUNJAB AT CHANDIGARH

### APPEAL NO. 74 OF 2022

Bharat Bhushan, S/o Sh. Harish Kumar, R/o House No 63, 22 Acre Area, Barnala (Punjab).

...Appellant

### Versus

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

### APPEAL NO. 75 OF 2022

Santosh Rani, W/o Sh. Bharat Bhushan, R/o House No 63, 22 Acre Area, Barnala (Punjab).

...Appellant

### Versus

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.

Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

### APPEAL NO. 76 OF 2022

Hari Chand S/o Sh. Panna Lal, R/o House No. 290, Astha Enclave, Barnala (Punjab).

...Appellant

Versus

2

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

### APPEAL NO. 77 OF 2022

Vinod Kumar S/o Sh. Charanjeet Lal, R/o House No. BX1119, ST No. 3, KC Road, Barnala (Punjab).

...Appellant

### Versus

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

#### APPEAL NO. 78 OF 2022

Ashok Kumar S/o Sh. Randhir Singh, R/o Flat No. 91, Pocket 2, Sector 19, Green View Apartment, Dwarka, South West District, New Delhi-110075

...Appellant

#### Versus

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- 2. Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- 3. Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002.

...Respondents

3

### **APPEAL NO. 79 OF 2022**

Achal Kumar, S/o Sh. Prakash Chand, R/o SCO 10 C, Old Tehsil Complex, Barnala, Punjab.

...Appellant

### Versus

- Real Estate Regulatory Authority, 1st Floor, Block-B, Plot No. 03, 1. Madhya Marg, Sector-18, Chandigarh 160018.
- 2. Punjab Urban Development Authority, Sector-62, Sahibzada Ajit Singh Nagar (Mohali) Punjab.
- Estate Officer, Urban Estate, Patiala, Pincode-147002. 3.

...Respondents

Present:

Mr. Ashok Gupta, Advocate for the appellant.

Ms. Navdeep Kaur, Advocate for RERA, Punjab

CORAM:

JUSTICE MAHESH GROVER (RETD.), CHAIRMAN

S.K. GARG DISTT. & SESSIONS JUDGE

(RETD.), MEMBER (JUDICIAL)

ER. ASHOK KUMAR GARG, CHIEF ENGINEER

(RETD.), MEMBER (ADMN./ TECH.)

### JUDGMENT: (JUSTICE MAHESH GROVER (RETD.), CHAIRMAN)

By this order we will dispose of the following appeals:-

2022 BHARAT BHUSHAN VS RERA, PUNJAB AND OTHERS
2022 SANTOSH RANI VS RERA, PUNJAB AND OTHERS
2022 HARI CHAND VS RERA, PUNJAB AND OTHERS
2022 VINOD KUMAR VS RERA PUNJAB AND OTHERS
2022 ASHOK KUMAR VS RERA, PUNJAB AND OTHERS
2022 ACHAL KUMAR VS RERA, PUNJAB AND OTHERS
2 2 2

The complainants filed their respective complaints against the 2. respondent-developer/promoter with a grievance that since the

### APPEAL NO. 74 OF 2022 TO APPEAL NO. 79 OF 2022

1

project was ongoing one, it had to be registered with the Authority. The respondents have taken up the plea before the Authority that since the project was complete it was exempted from the provisions of the Act. The Authority recorded a finding as below:-

"Arguments of Shri Ashok Gupta, have been considered and I do not find any merit therein. The Authority has held in "Dr. Anjali Sharma Vs. Gupta Builders and Promoters (P) Ltd". and other connected matters that complaints against such projects that are not registered with this Authority would not be maintainable. This is a clear and unequivocal finding and one cannot go into reasons behind non-registration of the project. It can separately be considered whether the respondent was liable to register the project and whether action under Section 59 of the Act of 2016 is called for. However this does not negate the finding of the Authority noted above."



We have already commented on this aspect in Appeal No. 60 of 2022 (Aman Sethi and Another Vs. Dara Buildtech and Developers Ltd. and another) and held that the Authority ought not to decline interference in complaints at the threshold on the ground that the project is not registered. We have rather

5

mandated the Authority that it has to satisfy itself in this regard before taking any decision on complaint.

4. In view of the decision rendered by us in Appeal No. 60 of 2022

(Aman Sethi and Another Vs. Dara Buildtech and Developers

Ltd. and another), we are of the opinion that the present appeals need to be accepted and while doing so, we remand the matter back to the Authority for reconsideration of the issue afresh.

Photocopy of this order be placed in connected cases.



JUSTICE MAHESH GROVER (RETD.)
CHAIRMAN

S.K. GARG, D & S. JUDGE (RETD.)
MEMBER (JUDICIAL)

ER. ASHOK KUMAR GARG, C.E. (RETD.), MEMBER (ADMINISTRATIVE/TECHNICAL)

July 25, 2022 AN

Certified To Be True Copy

Concurred Copy

Registrar

Period Chandingth

04/08/2022